

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE
EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
NORFOLK DIVISION**

Latasha Holloway, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

City of Virginia Beach, et al.,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 2:18-cv-0069

**DEFENDANTS' SUPPLEMENTAL MOTION FOR
ENTRY OF A PROTECTIVE ORDER**

COME NOW the Defendants, City of Virginia Beach, Virginia Beach City Council, Louis Jones, James Wood, Jessica Abbott, Aaron Rouse, Robert Dyer, Barbara Henley, Shannon Kane, John Moss, David Nygaard, Sabrina Wooten, Rosemary Wilson, in their official capacity as members of the Virginia Beach City Council, David L. Hansen, in his official capacity as City Manager, and Donna Patterson, in her official capacity as Director of Elections/General Registrar for the City of Virginia Beach (collectively "Defendants"), by counsel, and respectfully supplement their motion in this Court for entry of a protective order,¹ pursuant to Rules 26(c)(1) and 26(b)(1)(C)(iii) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, limiting discovery and subpoenas issued pursuant to Rule 45 at this time to only those matters relating to the three preconditions promulgated in *Thornburg v. Gingles*, 478 U.S. 30, 47 (1986).

¹ See Defendants' Motion for Protective Order and Memoranda of Law in Support of Motion for Protective Order (ECF Nos. 75, 76 and 78). Defendants expect that Plaintiffs will also oppose this Defendants' Supplemental Motion for Entry of a Protective Order for the same reasons stated by Plaintiffs in their opposition to the original motion.

WHEREFORE, for the reasons set forth above and in the attached memorandum, the Defendants hereby respectfully request entry of a protective order limiting the scope of discovery and subpoenas issued pursuant to Rule 45 at this time to requests related to the *Thornburg v. Gingles* preconditions, and for other relief as the Court deems appropriate.

Respectfully submitted,

CITY OF VIRGINIA BEACH, VIRGINIA BEACH CITY COUNCIL, LOUIS JONES, JAMES WOOD, JESSICA ABBOTT, AARON ROUSE, ROBERT DYER, DAVID NYGAARD, BARBARA HENLEY, SHANNON KANE, JOHN MOSS, SABRINA WOOTEN, and ROSEMARY WILSON, in their official capacity as members of the Virginia Beach City Council, DAVID L. HANSEN, in his official capacity as City Manager, and DONNA PATTERSON, in her official capacity as Director of Elections/General Registrar for the City of Virginia Beach,

By: _____/s/_____
Of Counsel

Mark D. Stiles (VSB No. 30683)
City Attorney
Christopher S. Boynton (VSB No. 38501)
Deputy City Attorney
Gerald L. Harris (VSB No. 80446)
Associate City Attorney
Joseph M. Kurt (VSB No. 90854)
Assistant City Attorney
Attorneys for the City of Virginia Beach
Office of the City Attorney
Municipal Center, Building One
2401 Courthouse Drive
Virginia Beach, Virginia 23456
(757) 385-4531 (Office)
(757) 385-5687 (Facsimile)
mstiles@vbgov.com
cboynton@vbgov.com
glharris@vbgov.com
jkurt@vbgov.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the 3rd day of July, 2019, I will electronically file the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will then send a notification of such filing (NEF) to the following:

Joseph Gerald Hebert
Danielle Marie Lang
Christopher Lamar
Annabelle Harless
Ruth Merewyn Greenwood
Campaign Legal Center
1411 K Street, NW
Suite 1400
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 736-2200 (telephone)
(202) 736-2222 (facsimile)
ghebert@campaignlegal.org
dlang@campaignlegal.org
clamar@campaignlegalcenter.org
aharless@campaignlegal.org
rgreenwood@campainlegal.org

_____/s/
Gerald L. Harris

Mark D. Stiles (VSB No. 30683)
City Attorney
Christopher S. Boynton (VSB No. 38501)
Deputy City Attorney
Gerald L. Harris (VSB No. 80446)
Associate City Attorney
Joseph M. Kurt
Assistant City Attorney (VSB No. 90854)
Attorneys for the City of Virginia Beach
Office of the City Attorney
Municipal Center, Building One, Room 260
2401 Courthouse Drive
Virginia Beach, Virginia 23456
(757) 385-8803 (Office)
(757) 385-5687 (Facsimile)
mstiles@vbgov.com
cboynton@vbgov.com
glharris@vbgov.com
jkurt@vbgov.com