NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### **Brenda A. Wise**

From: Monroe Wasch <monte@fairpoint.net>
Sent: Wednesday, May 18, 2022 10:59 AM

To: Brenda A. Wise

Subject: Columbia County & Redistricting

#### To Whom It May Concern:

I am writing in response to the draft Congressional map released earlier this week. I am a resident of Columbia County, and the proposed changes would have disastrous consequences for our county. If allowed to stand, Columbia County would be separated from both the Capital District and the Mid-Hudson Valley regions, as well as its county neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map groups our county with Southern Tier and Finger Lakes counties, with which it has no commonality or relationship. This is unprecedented and would result in a poor outcome for our county when it comes to identity, representation, and allocation of resources.

Columbia County is located along the Hudson River in the Mid-Hudson Valley, and the Department of Economic Development has placed Columbia County in the Capital District. Under the proposed map, Columbia County would be isolated from both regions and be the only county in CD19 on the east side of the Hudson River. Columbia County should be part of a contiguous district of adjoining Mid-Hudson Valley counties. Based on current 2020 Census data, the combined populations of Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties would be 748,393 people, which is within the range of +/- 10 percent of the average congressional district.

Columbia County has been excised from its peers and placed in a congressional district that shares little in common administratively. Our judicial, assembly, and senate districts have little, if any, overlap with other counties included in the proposed CD19. Effective government requires coordination and collaboration. The proposed map diminishes Columbia County's political power.

Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties have a common history, developing major agricultural and industrial centers because of their proximity to the Hudson River. There is no such common history with counties located in the middle and western portions of New York State.

The five County Seat Cities of Hudson, Poughkeepsie, Troy, Kingston, and Catskill had a similar rise as major industrial cities that suffered steep economic declines in the first half of the 20th century but are now experiencing a great resurgence. These small to medium sized cities have diverse racial, ethnic, religious, cultural, socio-economic, and gender/sexual orientation populations. These cities have higher poverty levels than the surrounding countryside and have similar challenges to meet the need for infrastructure, broadband, workforce housing, and healthcare throughout the counties. Columbia County should be in a congressional district with its neighbors who face the same challenges and concerns.

Our proximity to New York City has created a rich, year-round arts community, with many artists, painters, dancers, musicians, actors, galleries, and antique stores that all create a destination for tourism. There is a significant and growing population of New York City dual homeowners. Newer residents are starting local small businesses, adding to the economic diversity in our county. Columbia County is also home to many exurban communities of Albany, not Ithaca or Binghamton. Columbia County is tethered economically, culturally and socially to its neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map ignores these connections, and in doing so, denied our county of effective representation.

Please preserve Columbia County as a unified community of interest with our neighboring counties. We share similar agricultural, historic, artistic, and economic challenges and opportunities with Dutchess, Ulster, Rensselaer, and Greene

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Counties as part of the Mid-Hudson Valley region. Dividing Columbia County, or separating us from the Mid-Hudson Valley region, would seriously impact the residents who want to build for the future and be fairly represented in Congress. It would be a gross miscarriage of justice that will have long-term adverse consequences for our residents and our region if these district lines are allowed to stand. We urge you to correct this grave mistake.

Very truly yours,

Monte Wasch monte@fairpoint.net

P.O. Box 395 775 Canaan Road New Lebanon, NY 12125

518-781-0195 Cell: 646-526-5766

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From: Dianne Hobden <diannehobden@yahoo.com>

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:00 AM

To: Brenda A. Wise

**Subject:** Columbia County is part of the Hudson Valley

### To Whom It May Concern:

I am writing in response to the draft Congressional map released earlier this week. I am a resident of **Columbia County**, and the proposed changes would have disastrous consequences for our county. If allowed to stand, Columbia County would be separated from both the Capital District and the Mid-Hudson Valley regions, as well as its county neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map groups our county with Southern Tier and Finger Lakes counties, with which it has no commonality or relationship. This is unprecedented and would result in a poor outcome for our county when it comes to identity, representation, and allocation of resources.

Columbia County is located along the Hudson River in the Mid-Hudson Valley, and the Department of Economic Development has placed Columbia County in the Capital District. Under the proposed map, Columbia County would be isolated from both regions and be the only county in CD19 on the east side of the Hudson River. Columbia County should be part of a contiguous district of adjoining Mid-Hudson Valley counties. Based on current 2020 Census data, the combined populations of Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties would be 748,393 people, which is within the range of +/- 10 percent of the average congressional district.

Columbia County has been excised from its peers and placed in a congressional district that shares little in common administratively. Our judicial, assembly, and senate districts have little, if any, overlap with other counties included in the proposed CD19. Effective government requires coordination and collaboration. The proposed map diminishes Columbia County's political power.

Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties have a common history, developing major agricultural and industrial centers because of their proximity to the Hudson River. There is no such common history with counties located in the middle and western portions of New York State.

The five County Seat Cities of Hudson, Poughkeepsie, Troy, Kingston, and Catskill had a similar rise as major industrial cities that suffered steep economic declines in the first half of the 20th century but are now experiencing a great resurgence. These small to medium sized cities have diverse racial, ethnic, religious, cultural, socio-economic, and gender/sexual orientation populations. These cities have higher poverty levels than the surrounding countryside and have similar challenges to meet the need for infrastructure, broadband, workforce housing, and healthcare throughout the counties. Columbia County should be in a congressional district with its neighbors who face the same challenges and concerns.

Our proximity to New York City has created a rich, year-round arts community, with many artists, painters, dancers, musicians, actors, galleries, and antique stores that all create a destination for tourism. There is a significant and growing population of New York City dual homeowners. Newer residents are starting local small businesses, adding to the economic diversity in our county. Columbia County is also home to many exurban communities of Albany, not Ithaca or Binghamton. Columbia County is tethered economically, culturally and socially to its neighbors to the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

north and south. The proposed map ignores these connections, and in doing so, denied our county of effective representation.

Please preserve Columbia County as a unified community of interest with our neighboring counties. We share similar agricultural, historic, artistic, and economic challenges and opportunities with Dutchess, Ulster, Rensselaer, and Greene Counties as part of the Mid-Hudson Valley region. Dividing Columbia County, or separating us from the Mid-Hudson Valley region, would seriously impact the residents who want to build for the future and be fairly represented in Congress. It would be a gross miscarriage of justice that will have long-term adverse consequences for our residents and our region if these district lines are allowed to stand. We urge you to correct this grave mistake.

Very truly yours,

Dianne Hobden Canaan, Columbia County, NY

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From:

Caroline Stem <caroline.stem@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:00 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

**Subject:** 

Redistricting concerns

To whom it may concern,

As a resident of the City of Saratoga Springs NY, I am strongly opposed to the draft Congressional map that would remove my community from a Congressional district centered in New York's Capital Region. Saratoga Springs strongly identifies with the greater Capital Region and has strong economic and transportation ties to communities like Schenectady, Albany, Troy, and Amsterdam. Many of our residents work and have families in these communities. Placing Saratoga Springs into a district that stretches to the Canadian border with communities that have very different needs from our own will ultimately be detrimental to our community. I urge you to include Saratoga Springs in the proposed 20th Congressional District when you finalize the Congressional maps.

I appreciate your consideration of this request.

Sincerely,

Caroline Stem 55 Catherine Street Saratoga Springs, NY 12866

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# **Brenda A. Wise**

From:

Marianne Adrian on behalf of Hon. Norman St. George

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:00 AM

Subject:

Chief Sean Egan

Attachments:

Chief Sean Egan.pdf

Good Morning,

On behalf of Judge St. George, attached please find a memo regarding the retirement of Chief Sean Egan.

Thank you,

Marianne

# **Marianne Adrian**

Principal Administrative Assistant to Deputy Chief Administrative Judge Norman St. George, J.S.C. 100 Supreme Court Drive Mineola, NY 11501 Nassau Ph: (516) 493-3020 Nassau Fax: (516) 493-3290



Please be CAREFUL when clicking links or opening attachments.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# OFFICE OF THE DEPUTY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE

Courts Outside New York City



#### MEMORANDUM

To: Administrative Judges, Presiding Justice of the Court of Claims, Supervising

Judges, Justices, Judges and Non-Judicial Personnel

Hon. Norman St. George, J.S.C. From:

Deputy Chief Administrative Judge, Courts Outside New York City

Date: May 18, 2022

Re: Chief Sean Egan

Today marks the completion of an exemplary forty-one (41) year career of service for Chief Sean Egan. Chief Egan began his career with the New York State Unified Court System in 1991 assigned to Brooklyn Criminal Court. He was promoted to Sergeant in 1997 where he worked on the security detail for several Administrative Judges, then to Lieutenant in 1999 where he became the first Commanding Officer of the then-newly created Red Hook Justice Center in Brooklyn.

In 2006, Chief Egan accepted a position in the Third Judicial District where he was promoted to Captain. A short time later, he was promoted to Major in the Fifth Judicial District, then to District Chief in 2009. In 2016, he assumed the post of New York State Security Liaison assigned to the Office of the Deputy Chief Administrative Judge for Courts Outside New York City. At the close of business today, Chief Egan will retire.

A Walk-Out ceremony will take place at the Onondaga Combined Courthouse, Montgomery Street entrance at 3:00 pm. If you have the opportunity to attend, please do.

Chief Egan's experience, stellar reputation and commitment to service have benefitted our Courts greatly and we are truly grateful. Please join me in thanking Chief Egan for his excellent service and in wishing him all the best in his retirement.

Captain Kevin Scherer, of the DCAJ Office, will assist Chief Magliano with the Security responsibilities for the Courts Outside New York City until such time that the position is filled.

Stay safe and be well.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

## Brenda A. Wise

From:

marina babayeva <mbabayeva1@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:01 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Urgent

My name is Marina Babayeva, I am submitting this testimony in protest of the new maps that were released for the New York Senate. The Jewish communities of Kew Gardens Hills and Hillcrest were heavily involved in asking the Independent Redistricting Commission to keep these neighborhoods together. Furthermore, Pomonok Houses, and Electchester cooperative have always been part of our district, they are our neighbors, and many of our families originate from these public housing entities.

In the state legislatures plan, they took into account our testimony and made a district that combined most of the Jewish community in Central Queens. Kew Gardens Hills has been gerrymandered into a South East Queens State Senate District. Pomonok, Electchester and Hillcrest has been split off into a Flushing centered district. This is splitting our communities up. Communities of interest must be together in one district.

We ask that in your final draft you put the neighborhoods of Kew Gardens Hills, Pomonok, Electchester, and Hillcrest into the district you drew of cental Queens with Forest Hills, Rego Park, Middle Village, and Glendale. Please remove Ozone Park and Richmond Hill as they are not the same communities of interest as we are to the neighborhoods mentioned above.

Sincerely, Marina Babayeva

Sent from my iPhone

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Brenda A. Wise

From: Violetta Domatova <leahd7893@icloud.com>

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:01 AM

To: Brenda A. Wise

My name is Leah Maksumov, I am submitting this testimony in protest of the new maps that were released for the New York Senate. The Jewish communities of Kew Gardens Hills and Hillcrest were heavily involved in asking the Independent Redistricting Commission to keep these neighborhoods together. Furthermore, Pomonok Houses, and Electchester cooperative have always been part of our district, they are our neighbors, and many of our families originate from these public housing entities.

In the state legislatures plan, they took into account our testimony and made a district that combined most of the Jewish community in Central Queens. Kew Gardens Hills has been gerrymandered into a South East Queens State Senate District. Pomonok, Electchester and Hillcrest has been split off into a Flushing centered district. This is splitting our communities up. Communities of interest must be together in one district.

We ask that in your final draft you put the neighborhoods of Kew Gardens Hills, Pomonok, Electchester, and Hillcrest into the district you drew of cental Queens with Forest Hills, Rego Park, Middle Village, and Glendale. Please remove Ozone Park and Richmond Hill as they are not the same communities of interest as we are to the neighborhoods mentioned above.

Sincerely, Leah Maksumov

Sent from my iPhone

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

From:

peter t. johnson <ptj4512@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:04 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Columbia County & Redistricting

# dear fellow New Yorkers

it is with dismay that i contemplate the implications of the proposed maps. as a 4th generation farmer and resident of Claverack Township, the proposed removal of Columbia County from north and south neighboring counties will sever vital connections important for our family-owned small farms and businesses, most of which rely to some extent on some programs arising from State or Federal legislation. to be placed amidst counties with vastly different economic needs as well as populations cannot be of any benefit for those of us with longterm commitment to the prosperity and improvement of Columbia County.

for fairness to us now and to the rising generation of residents and workers, please return us to neighbors with shared history and economy. thank you.

peter t. johnson ptj4512@gmail.com 518.303.1239

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Brenda A. Wise

From:

Rosetta Conroy <stepsdaughter@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:04 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

**Subject:** 

REMAPPING CONGRESSIONAL DISTRICTS

I am a resident of Co-op City, Congressional District 16, Northeast Bronx, writing to express my disagreement at having my district splintered into three.

This plan would seriously diminish our voting power to elect candidates who best represent us, as people of color. Please consider our concerns as you make your determination on Thursday, May 19.

Thank you,
Rosetta Conroy
Sent from Mail for Windows

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From:

Yafa Abrakhimova <yaf707@yahoo.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:05 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

My name is Yafa Abrakhimova, I am submitting this testimony in protest of the new maps that were released for the New York Senate. The Jewish communities of Kew Gardens Hills and Hillcrest were heavily involved in asking the Independent Redistricting Commission to keep these neighborhoods together. Furthermore, Pomonok Houses, and Electchester cooperative have always been part of our district, they are our neighbors, and many of our families originate from these public housing entities.

In the state legislatures plan, they took into account our testimony and made a district that combined most of the Jewish community in Central Queens. Kew Gardens Hills has been gerrymandered into a South East Queens State Senate District. Pomonok, Electchester and Hillcrest has been split off into a Flushing centered district. This is splitting our communities up. Communities of interest must be together in one district.

We ask that in your final draft you put the neighborhoods of Kew Gardens Hills, Pomonok, Electchester, and Hillcrest into the district you drew of cental Queens with Forest Hills, Rego Park, Middle Village, and Glendale. Please remove Ozone Park and Richmond Hill as they are not the same communities of interest as we are to the neighborhoods mentioned above.

Sincerely, Yafa Abrakhimova

#### COUNTY CLERK 05/18/2022 STEUBEN

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

From:

Jordan Stein < steinj.13@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:05 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Public comments on the maps

Dear Mr. Wise,

I'm writing to comment on the proposed Congressional and State Senate District Lines. I'm really annoyed that these lines are so badly drawn. I live on the Upper East Side and it is patently ridiculous the group has with the upper west side which has always been a very different place with different interests and needs. Please reconsider and make different Maps.

-Jordan Stein 509 e 88th st

#### COUNTY CLERK 05/18/2022

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Brenda A. Wise

From: Amity Reed <amityr@fairpoint.net> Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:05 AM Sent:

Brenda A. Wise To:

Subject: Columbia County & Redistricting

#### To Whom It May Concern:

I am writing in response to the draft Congressional map released earlier this week. I am a resident of Columbia County, and the proposed changes would have disastrous consequences for our county. If allowed to stand, Columbia County would be separated from both the Capital District and the Mid-Hudson Valley regions, as well as its county neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map groups our county with Southern Tier and Finger Lakes counties, with which it has no commonality or relationship. This is unprecedented and would result in a poor outcome for our county when it comes to identity, representation, and allocation of resources.

Columbia County is located along the Hudson River in the Mid-Hudson Valley, and the Department of Economic Development has placed Columbia County in the Capital District. Under the proposed map, Columbia County would be isolated from both regions and be the only county in CD19 on the east side of the Hudson River. Columbia County should be part of a contiguous district of adjoining Mid-Hudson Valley counties. Based on current 2020 Census data, the combined populations of Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties would be 748,393 people, which is within the range of +/- 10 percent of the average congressional district.

Columbia County has been excised from its peers and placed in a congressional district that shares little in common administratively. Our judicial, assembly, and senate districts have little, if any, overlap with other counties included in the proposed CD19. Effective government requires coordination and collaboration. The proposed map diminishes Columbia County's political power.

Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties have a common history, developing major agricultural and industrial centers because of their proximity to the Hudson River. There is no such common history with counties located in the middle and western portions of New York State.

The five County Seat Cities of Hudson, Poughkeepsie, Troy, Kingston, and Catskill had a similar rise as major industrial cities that suffered steep economic declines in the first half of the 20th century but are now experiencing a great resurgence. These small to medium sized cities have diverse racial, ethnic, religious, cultural, socio-economic, and gender/sexual orientation populations. These cities have higher poverty levels than the surrounding countryside and have similar challenges to meet the need for infrastructure, broadband, workforce housing, and healthcare throughout the counties. Columbia County should be in a congressional district with its neighbors who face the same challenges and concerns.

Our proximity to New York City has created a rich, year-round arts community, with many artists, painters, dancers, musicians, actors, galleries, and antique stores that all create a destination for tourism. There is a significant and growing population of New York City dual homeowners. Newer residents are starting local small businesses, adding to the economic diversity in our county. Columbia County is also home to many exurban communities of Albany, not Ithaca or Binghamton. Columbia County is tethered economically, culturally and socially to its neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map ignores these connections, and in doing so, denied our county of effective representation.

Please preserve Columbia County as a unified community of interest with our neighboring counties. We share similar agricultural, historic, artistic, and economic challenges and opportunities with Dutchess, Ulster, Rensselaer, and Greene

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Counties as part of the Mid-Hudson Valley region. Dividing Columbia County, or separating us from the Mid-Hudson Valley region, would seriously impact the residents who want to build for the future and be fairly represented in Congress. It would be a gross miscarriage of justice that will have long-term adverse consequences for our residents and our region if these district lines are allowed to stand. We urge you to correct this grave mistake.

I feel very strongly about this and would be very upset with this change. Columbia County is a very strong part of the Hudson Valley. As a small business owner and home owner here I am very strongly against the proposed new map. I am in the very bottom of the county. I have a Red Hook postal zip code and pay Pine Plains taxes, but am physically in Columbia County in Gallatin NY. If I had a landline it would be an Elizaville number...We belong in the map we are currently in. Again: the proposed map groups our county with Southern Tier and Finger Lakes counties, with which it has no commonality or relationship. This is unprecedented and would result in a poor outcome for our county when it comes to identity, representation, and allocation of resources.

Very truly yours,

**Amity Reed** 

Amity Reed <u>amityr@fairpoint.net</u> 58 Church RD Red Hook, NY 12571

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From: Leisah yahoo <leisah@yahoo.com>
Sent: Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:06 AM

To: Brenda A. Wise

Subject: Columbia County & Redistricting

#### To Whom It May Concern:

I am writing in response to the draft Congressional map released earlier this week. I am a resident of Columbia County, and the proposed changes would have disastrous consequences for our county. If allowed to stand, Columbia County would be separated from both the Capital District and the Mid-Hudson Valley regions, as well as its county neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map groups our county with Southern Tier and Finger Lakes counties, with which it has no commonality or relationship. This is unprecedented and would result in a poor outcome for our county when it comes to identity, representation, and allocation of resources.

Columbia County is located along the Hudson River in the Mid-Hudson Valley, and the Department of Economic Development has placed Columbia County in the Capital District. Under the proposed map, Columbia County would be isolated from both regions and be the only county in CD19 on the east side of the Hudson River. Columbia County should be part of a contiguous district of adjoining Mid-Hudson Valley counties. Based on current 2020 Census data, the combined populations of Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties would be 748,393 people, which is within the range of +/- 10 percent of the average congressional district.

Columbia County has been excised from its peers and placed in a congressional district that shares little in common administratively. Our judicial, assembly, and senate districts have little, if any, overlap with other counties included in the proposed CD19. Effective government requires coordination and collaboration. The proposed map diminishes Columbia County's political power.

Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties have a common history, developing major agricultural and industrial centers because of their proximity to the Hudson River. There is no such common history with counties located in the middle and western portions of New York State.

The five County Seat Cities of Hudson, Poughkeepsie, Troy, Kingston, and Catskill had a similar rise as major industrial cities that suffered steep economic declines in the first half of the 20th century but are now experiencing a great resurgence. These small to medium sized cities have diverse racial, ethnic, religious, cultural, socio-economic, and gender/sexual orientation populations. These cities have higher poverty levels than the surrounding countryside and have similar challenges to meet the need for infrastructure, broadband, workforce housing, and healthcare throughout the counties. Columbia County should be in a congressional district with its neighbors who face the same challenges and concerns.

Our proximity to New York City has created a rich, year-round arts community, with many artists, painters, dancers, musicians, actors, galleries, and antique stores that all create a destination for tourism. There is a significant and growing population of New York City dual homeowners. Newer residents are starting local small businesses, adding to the economic diversity in our county. Columbia County is also home to many exurban communities of Albany, not Ithaca or Binghamton. Columbia County is tethered economically, culturally and socially to its neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map ignores these connections, and in doing so, denied our county of effective representation.

Please preserve Columbia County as a unified community of interest with our neighboring counties. We share similar agricultural, historic, artistic, and economic challenges and opportunities with Dutchess, Ulster, Rensselaer, and Greene Counties as part of the Mid-Hudson Valley region. Dividing Columbia County, or separating us from the Mid-Hudson

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Valley region, would seriously impact the residents who want to build for the future and be fairly represented in Congress. It would be a gross miscarriage of justice that will have long-term adverse consequences for our residents and our region if these district lines are allowed to stand. We urge you to correct this grave mistake.

Very truly yours,

Leisah Swenson 203-496-1169 text AEA Stage Manager @homemadehudson @atelierroquette @farmetteroquette

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From:

Caroline Scognamiglio <cscognamiglio8@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:07 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Keep the Capital Region Congressional District Together!

The Capital Region historically has been kept together in the same Congressional District for good reason - the shared communities and cities of Albany, Amsterdam, Saratoga Springs, Schenectady, and Troy have deep roots binding them together. We share common services through the CDTA and SUNY systems. Keep it together!!!!

Caroline Scognamiglio, Licensed Real Estate Salesperson Re/Max Platinum 52 N. Greenbush Rd. Troy, NY 12180 (518) 986-2060 (518) 720-3400

×	vay activism in which the count factor from the country and th
_	

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

## Brenda A. Wise

From:

danadurso14@gmail.com

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:08 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

**Congressional Maps** 

To Whom it May Concern,

As the Special Master's plan is currently drafted, my community of (Massapequa, Massapequa Park, North Massapequa, Farmingdale, Levittown, Bethpage, etc) would be removed from its current South Shore Congressional District of NY-2 and placed in the North Shore Congressional District of NY-3. I urge you to reconsider this misguided plan and keep the South Shore communities of Long Island together as in the current 2nd Congressional District.

Long Island's North Shore and South Shore communities are different in almost every way. Residents of the South Shore experience the same flooding issues, share highways and public transportation infrastructure, and have a community connection that we do not share with North Shore residents. After our South Shore communities were devastated by Superstorm Sandy, we rebuilt them together and are stronger because of it. Please do not split us up. The interests of my community align with my South Shore neighbors in the 2nd Congressional District. We do not want to be part of a North Shore district.

I urge you to put my town back in the 2nd Congressional District and keep the South Shore communities together. This district was redrawn by a special master a decade ago, and it has had effective representation since. Please reverse the draft map so our communities can continue to work together.

Many thanks, Dana Durso Resident of Massapequa Park Sent from my iPhone

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From:

Rachel Harrison <rachelhstudio@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:09 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Columbia County & Redistricting

To Whom It May Concern:

WE LIVE IN ANCRAM, NY

zip code 11249

WE URGENTLY HOPE YOU WILL NOT RE-DISTRICT US!

WE ARE PART OF COLUMBIA COUNTY AND SHOULD VOTE AS SUCH!

Find below our further thoughts.

Respectively,

Rachel Harrison Eric Banks

I am writing in response to the draft Congressional map released earlier this week. I am a resident of Columbia County, and the proposed changes would have disastrous consequences for our county. If allowed to stand, Columbia County would be separated from both the Capital District and the Mid-Hudson Valley regions, as well as its county neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map groups our county with Southern Tier and Finger Lakes counties, with which it has no commonality or relationship. This is unprecedented and would result in a poor outcome for our county when it comes to identity, representation, and allocation of resources.

Columbia County is located along the Hudson River in the Mid-Hudson Valley, and the Department of Economic Development has placed Columbia County in the Capital District. Under the proposed map, Columbia County would be isolated from both regions and be the only county in CD19 on the east side of the Hudson River. Columbia County should be part of a contiguous district of adjoining Mid-Hudson Valley counties. Based on current 2020 Census data, the combined populations of Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties would be 748,393 people, which is within the range of +/- 10 percent of the average congressional district.

Columbia County has been excised from its peers and placed in a congressional district that shares little in common administratively. Our judicial, assembly, and senate districts have little, if any, overlap with other counties included in the proposed CD19. Effective government requires coordination and collaboration. The proposed map diminishes Columbia County's political power.

Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties have a common history, developing major agricultural and industrial centers because of their proximity to the Hudson River. There is no such common history with counties located in the middle and western portions of New York State.

The five County Seat Cities of Hudson, Poughkeepsie, Troy, Kingston, and Catskill had a similar rise as major industrial cities that suffered steep economic declines in the first half of the 20th century but are now experiencing a great resurgence. These small to medium sized cities have diverse racial, ethnic, religious, cultural, socio-economic, and

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

gender/sexual orientation populations. These cities have higher poverty levels than the surrounding countryside and have similar challenges to meet the need for infrastructure, broadband, workforce housing, and healthcare throughout the counties. Columbia County should be in a congressional district with its neighbors who face the same challenges and concerns.

Our proximity to New York City has created a rich, year-round arts community, with many artists, painters, dancers, musicians, actors, galleries, and antique stores that all create a destination for tourism. There is a significant and growing population of New York City dual homeowners. Newer residents are starting local small businesses, adding to the economic diversity in our county. Columbia County is also home to many exurban communities of Albany, not Ithaca or Binghamton. Columbia County is tethered economically, culturally and socially to its neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map ignores these connections, and in doing so, denied our county of effective representation.

Please preserve Columbia County as a unified community of interest with our neighboring counties. We share similar agricultural, historic, artistic, and economic challenges and opportunities with Dutchess, Ulster, Rensselaer, and Greene Counties as part of the Mid-Hudson Valley region. Dividing Columbia County, or separating us from the Mid-Hudson Valley region, would seriously impact the residents who want to build for the future and be fairly represented in Congress. It would be a gross miscarriage of justice that will have long-term adverse consequences for our residents and our region if these district lines are allowed to stand. We urge you to correct this grave mistake.

Very truly yours,

# STEUBEN COUNTY CLERK 05/18/2022

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Brenda A. Wise

From: Enid Futterman <enid@imby.com> Sent: Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:10 AM

To: Brenda A. Wise

Subject: Columbia County & Redistricting

#### To Whom It May Concern:

I am writing in response to the draft Congressional map released earlier this week. I am a resident of Columbia County, and the proposed changes would have disastrous consequences for our county. If allowed to stand, Columbia County would be separated from both the Capital District and the Mid-Hudson Valley regions, as well as its county neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map groups our county with Southern Tier and Finger Lakes counties, with which it has no commonality or relationship. This is unprecedented and would result in a poor outcome for our county when it comes to identity, representation, and allocation of resources.

Columbia County is located along the Hudson River in the Mid-Hudson Valley, and the Department of Economic Development has placed Columbia County in the Capital District. Under the proposed map, Columbia County would be isolated from both regions and be the only county in CD19 on the east side of the Hudson River. Columbia County should be part of a contiguous district of adjoining Mid-Hudson Valley counties. Based on current 2020 Census data, the combined populations of Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties would be 748,393 people, which is within the range of +/- 10 percent of the average congressional district.

Columbia County has been excised from its peers and placed in a congressional district that shares little in common administratively. Our judicial, assembly, and senate districts have little, if any, overlap with other counties included in the proposed CD19. Effective government requires coordination and collaboration. The proposed map diminishes Columbia County's political power.

Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties have a common history, developing major agricultural and industrial centers because of their proximity to the Hudson River. There is no such common history with counties located in the middle and western portions of New York State.

The five County Seat Cities of Hudson, Poughkeepsie, Troy, Kingston, and Catskill had a similar rise as major industrial cities that suffered steep economic declines in the first half of the 20th century but are now experiencing a great resurgence. These small to medium sized cities have diverse racial, ethnic, religious, cultural, socio-economic, and gender/sexual orientation populations. These cities have higher poverty levels than the surrounding countryside and have similar challenges to meet the need for infrastructure, broadband, workforce housing, and healthcare throughout the counties. Columbia County should be in a congressional district with its neighbors who face the same challenges and concerns.

Our proximity to New York City has created a rich, year-round arts community, with many artists, painters, dancers, musicians, actors, galleries, and antique stores that all create a destination for tourism. There is a significant and growing population of New York City dual homeowners. Newer residents are starting local small businesses, adding to the economic diversity in our county. Columbia County is also home to many exurban communities of Albany, not Ithaca or Binghamton. Columbia County is tethered economically, culturally and socially to its neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map ignores these connections, and in doing so, denied our county of effective representation.

Please preserve Columbia County as a unified community of interest with our neighboring counties. We share similar agricultural, historic, artistic, and economic challenges and opportunities with Dutchess, Ulster, Rensselaer, and Greene

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Counties as part of the Mid-Hudson Valley region. Dividing Columbia County, or separating us from the Mid-Hudson Valley region, would seriously impact the residents who want to build for the future and be fairly represented in Congress. It would be a gross miscarriage of justice that will have long-term adverse consequences for our residents and

our region if these district lines are allowed to stand. We urge you to correct this grave mistake.

Very truly yours,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

**Enid Futterman** 



Enid Futterman Editorial Director 518-929-2295 | enid@imby.com

Virtual community to build actual community.

STEUBEN COUNTY CLERK 05/18/2022

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Brenda A. Wise

aroberti@catskill.net

From: Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:12 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Comments on new map

I am very upset by the new proposed maps. These maps do not keep associated areas of New York together, thereby diluting our ability to work together with our representatives. I hope the maps will be revised again

Thank you

Ann Roberti

Andes, NY

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Branda A Wisa

Brend	la A.	Wise
-------	-------	------

From:

peggy webb <pegwebb212@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:12 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise; cervas@cmu.edu

Subject:

fractured Ulster County voting districts

Please continue to fight for a reasoned, workable solution to the redistricting of my county. I applaud you both.

Sent from Mail for Windows

# STEUBEN COUNTY CLERK 05/18/2022

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

From:

Louise Bloomfield <louise.bloomfield@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:12 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Special Master's Congressional Redistricting Map: Kingston, NY, SHould NOT be Split

### To Whom it May Concern:

I am writing against the Special Master's redistricting map that splits Kingston, a city of fewer than 24,000 people, between two proposed new Congressional districts (18 and 19). Kingston, in current CD19, is the county seat of Ulster County, a rural county that struggles with many issues. Kingston is a city where a minority population needs its representation preserved and enhanced. In the recent past, it and Ulster County have lost all its mental health beds to medical services consolidation. The city needs unified advocacy and representation at federal level.

Both city and county will be undermined if Kingston is not kept intact in a single Congressional district. This draft map fails to preserve both a community of interest and a core of current CD19.

Thank you for your consideration, Louise Bloomfield Saugerties, NY (CD19)

STEUBEN COUNTY CLERK 05/18/2022

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Brenda A. Wise

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

From: Jaime Schwarz < jaimeschwarz@gmail.com>

Sent: Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:12 AM

To: Brenda A. Wise

Subject: Public comment on redistricting

I believe these maps don't take into account Ny state law for fair representation laws for minorities

Thanks, Jaime Schwarz **NY Resident** 

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From:

Mitch Cohen <mitchcohen@yahoo.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:10 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise; cervas@cmu.edu

Subject:

Saratoga Springs' Congressional District

то Justice Patrick McAllister & Mr. Cervas,

I am a resident of the City of Saratoga Springs, NY. I am writing to request that the City of Saratoga Springs remain in the 20th Congressional District and not be placed in the 21st as presently proposed.

The City of Saratoga Springs is very much a part of the Capital region and where I spend nearly all of my waking hours (Albany, Troy and Schenectady). The representational concerns of my small city have little to share with NY's North Country.

Placing us inside the 21st would be detrimental to Saratoga Springs and detrimental to the existing residents of the 21st.

Thank you, Mr. Cervas, for working to serve the whole of NY in a scientific and unbiased way. And thank you Judge McAllister for ensuring this process remains non-political.

I appreciate both your service,

Mitchell E. Cohen 302 Nelson Avenue Saratoga Springs, NY 12866

STEUBEN COUNTY CLERK 05/18/2022

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

From:

James Mumm <jamesmumm@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:13 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise; STEUBEN\_SUPERIOR; cervas@cmu.edu

Subject:

Testimony on the redistricting of NY-16

Hello,

I am a constituent in NY-16 and have family members in the district in Yonkers and Riverdale. I am shocked that you would consider diluting the voice of the African American community by 17% in NY-16. I urge you to do the right thing and retain the northeast Bronx communities of Co-Op City, Edenwald, and Williamsbridge with lower Westchester in NY-16.

I am originally from Buffalo and it is racial segregation that concentrated the African American community on the east side, which then led the racist murderer to choose that community to massacre African Americans at the Tops supermarket. You may not know this but that Tops was on the east side because the African American community organized to get a full service grocery story in what was a food desert. It was the prevalence of gerrymandered political districts that diluted the political voice of the African American community in Buffalo. We cannot allow that to happen here.

I urge you to not splinter the African American community between NY-14, NY-15, and NY-16. We need a fair map that maintains the voice of the Black community at a time when it is desperately needed to preserve our democracy.

Sincerely,

James Mumm 236 Clinton Avenue New Rochelle, NY 10801

# STEUBEN COUNTY CLERK 05/18/2022

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

From:

Len Grossman < leonardgrossman1@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:13 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Columbia County & Redistricting

Please keep Columbia County in the mid-Husdon valley region.

Len Grossman 862-216-8545

leonardgrossman1@gmail.com

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

From:

eric dunst <detour718@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:13 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Electoral map

Hi,

Please keep the map the way it was. Your new map, while reasonable in a perfect world, in reality is a paving stone on the road to fascism. There is a bigger picture here and we must play by one set of rules. Your map is unilaterally disarming one party, the democrats

<sup>~</sup> reply/ignore/destroy

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

From:

Marjorie Engber <marjorie-engber@nyc.rr.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:13 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

New redistricting maps

The new maps do not represent community of interests and force contests between existing excellent representatives. It seems to me that the new districts are not compatible with the state constitution.

I strongly recommend that they be redrawn to be more equitable to the varied constituencies in New York City and upstate.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

From:

Andrew Saunders <aosaunders@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:13 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Columbia County & Redistricting

#### To Whom It May Concern:

I am writing in response to the draft Congressional map released earlier this week. I am a resident of Columbia County, and the proposed changes would have disastrous consequences for our county. If allowed to stand, Columbia County would be separated from both the Capital District and the Mid-Hudson Valley regions, as well as its county neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map groups our county with Southern Tier and Finger Lakes counties, with which it has no commonality or relationship. This is unprecedented and would result in a poor outcome for our county when it comes to identity, representation, and allocation of resources.

Columbia County is located along the Hudson River in the Mid-Hudson Valley, and the Department of Economic Development has placed Columbia County in the Capital District. Under the proposed map, Columbia County would be isolated from both regions and be the only county in CD19 on the east side of the Hudson River. Columbia County should be part of a contiguous district of adjoining Mid-Hudson Valley counties. Based on current 2020 Census data, the combined populations of Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties would be 748,393 people, which is within the range of +/- 10 percent of the average congressional district.

Columbia County has been excised from its peers and placed in a congressional district that shares little in common administratively. Our judicial, assembly, and senate districts have little, if any, overlap with other counties included in the proposed CD19. Effective government requires coordination and collaboration. The proposed map diminishes Columbia County's political power.

Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties have a common history, developing major agricultural and industrial centers because of their proximity to the Hudson River. There is no such common history with counties located in the middle and western portions of New York State.

The five County Seat Cities of Hudson, Poughkeepsie, Troy, Kingston, and Catskill had a similar rise as major industrial cities that suffered steep economic declines in the first half of the 20th century but are now experiencing a great resurgence. These small to medium sized cities have diverse racial, ethnic, religious, cultural, socio-economic, and gender/sexual orientation populations. These cities have higher poverty levels than the surrounding countryside and have similar challenges to meet the need for infrastructure, broadband, workforce housing, and healthcare throughout the counties. Columbia County should be in a congressional district with its neighbors who face the same challenges and concerns.

Our proximity to New York City has created a rich, year-round arts community, with many artists, painters, dancers, musicians, actors, galleries, and antique stores that all create a destination for tourism. There is a significant and growing population of New York City dual homeowners. Newer residents are starting local small businesses, adding to the economic diversity in our county. Columbia County is also home to many exurban communities of Albany, not Ithaca or Binghamton. Columbia County is tethered economically, culturally and socially to its neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map ignores these connections, and in doing so, denied our county of effective representation.

Please preserve Columbia County as a unified community of interest with our neighboring counties. We share similar agricultural, historic, artistic, and economic challenges and opportunities with Dutchess, Ulster, Rensselaer, and Greene

#### COUNTY CLERK 05/18/2022 STEUBEN

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Counties as part of the Mid-Hudson Valley region. Dividing Columbia County, or separating us from the Mid-Hudson

Valley region, would seriously impact the residents who want to build for the future and be fairly represented in Congress. It would be a gross miscarriage of justice that will have long-term adverse consequences for our residents and our region if these district lines are allowed to stand. We urge you to correct this grave mistake.

Very truly yours, **Andrew Saunders** 22 Springbrook Lane Hillsdale, NY 11238

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### **Brenda A. Wise**

From:

Jane Greenberg <jxgreenberg@icloud.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:14 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

**Subject:** 

Redrawn District NY Maps

Hello,

I'm writing to express my concern about the newly drawn congressional maps and to ask the judge to please reconsider allowing them to stand.

Let's not make this change without more examination of the situation. Please pass my concern along and urge him to leave the maps as they stand for now.

Thank you for your consideration,

Jane Greenberg 39 East 12th Street New York, NY 10003 917-608-3478

Sent from my iPad

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Brenda A. Wise

From:

David McCarthy < djdmc55@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:14 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Redistricting comment

Good day. I enthusiastically write in support of the new redistricting map. Thank you,
David McCarthy
NYC Resident/Voter
Registered Democrat

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

From: Eric Jacobs <edj516@yahoo.com>
Sent: Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:14 AM

To: Brenda A. Wise

Subject: Columbia County & Redistricting

#### To Whom It May Concern:

I am writing in response to the draft Congressional map released earlier this week. I am a resident of Columbia County, and the proposed changes would have disastrous consequences for our county. If allowed to stand, Columbia County would be separated from both the Capital District and the Mid-Hudson Valley regions, as well as its county neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map groups our county with Southern Tier and Finger Lakes counties, with which it has no commonality or relationship. This is unprecedented and would result in a poor outcome for our county when it comes to identity, representation, and allocation of resources.

Columbia County is located along the Hudson River in the Mid-Hudson Valley, and the Department of Economic Development has placed Columbia County in the Capital District. Under the proposed map, Columbia County would be isolated from both regions and be the only county in CD19 on the east side of the Hudson River.

Columbia County should be part of a contiguous district of adjoining Mid-Hudson Valley counties. Based on current 2020 Census data, the combined populations of Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties would be 748,393 people, which is within the range of +/- 10 percent of the average congressional district. Columbia County has been excised from its peers and placed in a congressional district that shares little in common administratively. Our judicial, assembly, and senate districts have little, if any, overlap with other counties included in the proposed CD19. Effective government requires coordination and collaboration. The proposed map diminishes Columbia County's political power. Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties have a common history, developing major agricultural and industrial centers because of their proximity to the Hudson River.

There is no such common history with counties located in the middle and western portions of New York State. The five County Seat Cities of Hudson, Poughkeepsie, Troy, Kingston, and Catskill had a similar rise as major industrial cities that suffered steep economic declines in the first half of the 20th century but are now experiencing a great resurgence. These small to medium sized cities have diverse racial, ethnic, religious, cultural, socio-economic, and gender/sexual orientation populations. These cities have higher poverty levels than the surrounding countryside and have similar challenges to meet the need for infrastructure, broadband, workforce housing, and healthcare throughout the counties. Columbia County should be in a congressional district with its neighbors who face the same challenges and concerns.

Our proximity to New York City has created a rich, year-round arts community, with many artists, painters, dancers, musicians, actors, galleries, and antique stores that all create a destination for tourism. There is a significant and growing population of New York City dual homeowners. Newer residents are starting local small businesses, adding to the economic diversity in our county. Columbia County is also home to many exurban communities of Albany, not Ithaca or Binghamton. Columbia County is tethered economically, culturally and socially to its neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map ignores these connections, and in doing so, denied our county of effective representation. Please preserve Columbia County as a unified community of interest with our neighboring counties. We share similar agricultural, historic, artistic, and economic challenges and opportunities with Dutchess, Ulster, Rensselaer, and Greene Counties as part of the Mid-Hudson Valley region. Dividing Columbia County, or separating us from the Mid-Hudson Valley region, would seriously impact the residents who want to build for the future and be fairly represented in Congress. It would be a gross miscarriage of justice that will have long-term adverse consequences for our residents and our region if these district lines are allowed to stand. We urge you to correct this grave mistake.

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Very truly yours,

**Eric Jacobs** 

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

From:

Michael Brent < mjbrent1@gmail.com>

Sent:

To:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:15 AM

Subject:

Brenda A. Wise Redistributing

I am appalled that our state is going backwards when it comes to the redrawing of our maps. Please keep NY fair and free!

Thank you.

Best,

Mike Brent

(516)382-2780

Sent From My iPhone

STEUBEN COUNTY CLERK 05/18/2022 NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From:

Emma Dessau <emmardessau@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:15 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

**Subject:** 

Complaint about maps

To whom it may concern. These maps are drawn in a way that pits incumbents against each other, driving the divide within congress even further. In a time of unbelievable gridlock and anger, our state does not need to be pitted against itself. Please reconsider moving forward with this map that will stoke anger and do nothing to help the government do it's job. --

Emma Dessau (she/her)

emmardessau@gmail.com | 973.202.5753

emmadessau.com

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

**Brenda A. Wise** 

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

From:

Julia Damon < jmdamon@icloud.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:15 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

**Don't Support Redistricting Lines** 

I don't support the redrawn maps as they are in violation of the voting rights acts in NY d/t their minimizing BPOC representation in areas like sunset park.

Best, Julia Damon Green MAT OTD OTR/L

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From:

Betsy Zubroff <br/> <br/> bzubroff@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:15 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Redistributing

As a former employee in the city of Kingston I implore you to redo the congressional districts that split the city of Kingston in two. This must be corrected.

Thank you.

Elizabeth Zubroff

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From:

Jennifer <jennychillrud@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:16 AM

To: Subject: Brenda A. Wise Redistricting

Sir,

As a resident of the city of Saratoga Springs, NY, I am strongly opposed to the draft Congressional map that would remove my community from a Congressional district centered in New York's Capital Region. Saratoga Springs strongly identifies with the greater Capital Region and has strong economic and transportation ties to communities like Schenectady, Albany, Troy, and Amsterdam. Many of our residents work and have families in these communities. Placing Saratoga Springs into a district that stretches to the Canadian border with communities that have much different needs than our own will ultimately be detrimental to our community. I urge you to include Saratoga Springs in the proposed 20th Congressional District when you finalize the Congressional maps.

Thank you for your consideration.

Jennifer Taaffe Chillrud

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

From:

Margaret Tomlinson <margaretdonsbach@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:17 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Special Master: Greene County Redistricting

Dear Mr. Cervas,

As a voter in Catskill and Greene County, NY, I am distressed to discover that Greene and Columbia Counties have been placed in separate voting districts in the new district maps. Greene and Columbia are so deeply connected that we are often called the "twin counties." With a major highway bridge joining Catskill with Columbia County's main population center, the City of Hudson, we are much more joined than divided by the Hudson River, both counties identifying as part of the Hudson River Valley. In contrast, the mountain range of the Catskills serves as a significant barrier dividing Greene in both character and ease of travel from the counties to its west.

# Greene and Columbia Counties share numerous crucial local services:

- Greene County has no hospital; the closest hospital for Greene residents is Columbia Memorial, in Hudson.
- Greene and Columbia Counties share a community college, Columbia-Greene Community College, located in Hudson.
- The local branch of the Cornell University Extension program serves both Greene and Columbia Counties.
- The nonprofit organization Mental Health Association of Columbia-Greene Counties, Inc., serves both counties and plays a major role in providing mental health services to residents of both counties.
- The nonprofit organization Twin County Recovery Services serves both counties, providing clinics in both counties for substance abuse recovery and rehabilitation services.

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

The closest train station for the line providing passenger rail service to New York City for Greene County residents is located in Hudson, a five-minute drive from Catskill.

Greene and Columbia Counties essentially form a single community, with Greene County residents dependent upon many services located in Columbia County that serve Greene County residents. I urge you to adjust the district maps to keep Greene and Columbia Counties in the same district, as we have been in the past. To separate these twin counties into different districts would violate the principle of keeping communities intact when setting district boundaries.

Thank you.

Margaret Tomlinson Catskill, Greene County, NY

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From:

Richard Cutler < rwclaw@msn.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:18 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

**Subject:** 

The Congressional District Maps

Dear Mr. wise,

I have two criticisms concerning the new congressional district maps:

- 1. Manhattan neighborhoods are for the most part divided by east-west. Has the appointed drawer of the maps ever been to Manhattan?
- 2. I do not understand how northern and rural New York, which are losing population, seem to keep the same representation.

Very truly yours, Richard W. Cutler, Esq.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From:

Charlene Paden <charlenepaden@mindspring.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:18 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Columbia County & Redistricting

#### To Whom It May Concern:

I am writing in response to the draft Congressional map released earlier this week. I am a resident of Columbia County, and the proposed changes would have disastrous consequences for our county. If allowed to stand, Columbia County would be separated from both the Capital District and the Mid-Hudson Valley regions, as well as its county neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map groups our county with Southern Tier and Finger Lakes counties, with which it has no commonality or relationship. This is unprecedented and would result in a poor outcome for our county when it comes to identity, representation, and allocation of resources.

Columbia County is located along the Hudson River in the Mid-Hudson Valley, and the Department of Economic Development has placed Columbia County in the Capital District. Under the proposed map, Columbia County would be isolated from both regions and be the only county in CD19 on the east side of the Hudson River. Columbia County should be part of a contiguous district of adjoining Mid-Hudson Valley counties. Based on current 2020 Census data, the combined populations of Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties would be 748,393 people, which is within the range of +/- 10 percent of the average congressional district.

Columbia County has been excised from its peers and placed in a congressional district that shares little in common administratively. Our judicial, assembly, and senate districts have little, if any, overlap with other counties included in the proposed CD19. Effective government requires coordination and collaboration. The proposed map diminishes Columbia County's political power.

Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties have a common history, developing major agricultural and industrial centers because of their proximity to the Hudson River. There is no such common history with counties located in the middle and western portions of New York State.

The five County Seat Cities of Hudson, Poughkeepsie, Troy, Kingston, and Catskill had a similar rise as major industrial cities that suffered steep economic declines in the first half of the 20th century but are now experiencing a great resurgence. These small to medium sized cities have diverse racial, ethnic, religious, cultural, socio-economic, and gender/sexual orientation populations. These cities have higher poverty levels than the surrounding countryside and have similar challenges to meet the need for infrastructure, broadband, workforce housing, and healthcare throughout the counties. Columbia County should be in a congressional district with its neighbors who face the same challenges and concerns.

Our proximity to New York City has created a rich, year-round arts community, with many artists, painters, dancers, musicians, actors, galleries, and antique stores that all create a destination for tourism. There is a significant and growing population of New York City dual homeowners. Newer residents are starting local small businesses, adding to the economic diversity in our county. Columbia County is also home to many exurban communities of Albany, not Ithaca or Binghamton. Columbia County is tethered economically, culturally and socially to its neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map ignores these connections, and in doing so, denied our county of effective representation.

Please preserve Columbia County as a unified community of interest with our neighboring counties. We share similar agricultural, historic, artistic, and economic challenges and opportunities with Dutchess, Ulster, Rensselaer, and Greene Counties as part of the Mid-Hudson Valley region. Dividing Columbia County, or separating us from the Mid-Hudson

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Valley region, would seriously impact the residents who want to build for the future and be fairly represented in Congress. It would be a gross miscarriage of justice that will have long-term adverse consequences for our residents and our region if these district lines are allowed to stand. We urge you to correct this grave mistake.

Very truly yours, Charlene Paden 2041 County Route 27 Craryville NY 12521

Sent from my iPhone

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

From:

K Williams < ktw134@icloud.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:18 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

**Subject:** 

Do not finalize Redrawn District Maps

Dear Judge

Please do not finalize the redistricting map that was drawn up recently by the specialist. It isn't fair to the people of New York.

If the map cannot be redrawn to represent what the majority of New York residents want, then please keep the district voting map, the way that it was drawn over the last few years. Don't fix what is NOT broken!

Thank you very much

Sent from my iPhone

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From:

Paul Dinter <pedinter@optonline.net>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:18 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Redistricting mistake

#### Your Honor:

Please reject the maps of the Special Master because, as they're NEAT, but not fair to the communal groups in the whole extended NY metro area. It would seem to violate the NYS Constitution in prejudicing many minority communities. Dividing Brooklyn neighborhoods like Crown Heights into FOUR districts makes no sense.

#### Thank you.

Paul E. Dinter, Ph.D. (914) 260-1367 pedinter@optonline.net Ossining, NY 10562

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Brenda A. Wise

From:

Barbara Sacharow < blsacharow@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:19 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

redistricting chaos

To Judge McAllister:

I respectfully beg you not to finalize the current redistricting plan for the upcoming primary elections in New York.

It not only does <u>not</u> achieve the fairness that redistricting is supposed to accomplish, but it further disadvantages local minority representation. Moreover, by pitting some popular elected officials against each other, you will be denying the people the right to choose who best represents them.

Furthermore, the confusion and disenfranchisement that will ensue at the two different dates for voters to go to the polls (especially in August!) should be enough to stop any changes from taking effect before the primaries.

Other states have halted redistricting efforts because of the chaos it would cause and I hope you will see fit to do the same.

Sincerely,

Voter and poll worker

**Barbara Sacharow** 

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

#### Brenda A. Wise

From: Michael O'Hara < jmichaelohara@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:19 AM

To: Brenda A. Wise

Subject: Columbia County & Redistricting

#### To Whom It May Concern:

I am writing in response to the draft Congressional map released earlier this week. I am a resident of Columbia County, and the proposed changes would have disastrous consequences for our county. If allowed to stand, Columbia County would be separated from both the Capital District and the Mid-Hudson Valley regions, as well as its county neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map groups our county with Southern Tier and Finger Lakes counties, with which it has no commonality or relationship. This is unprecedented and would result in a poor outcome for our county when it comes to identity, representation, and allocation of resources.

Columbia County is located along the Hudson River in the Mid-Hudson Valley, and the Department of Economic Development has placed Columbia County in the Capital District. Under the proposed map, Columbia County would be isolated from both regions and be the only county in CD19 on the east side of the Hudson River. Columbia County should be part of a contiguous district of adjoining Mid-Hudson Valley counties. Based on current 2020 Census data, the combined populations of Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties would be 748,393 people, which is within the range of +/- 10 percent of the average congressional district.

Columbia County has been excised from its peers and placed in a congressional district that shares little in common administratively. Our judicial, assembly, and senate districts have little, if any, overlap with other counties included in the proposed CD19. Effective government requires coordination and collaboration. The proposed map diminishes Columbia County's political power.

Columbia, Dutchess, Rensselaer, Ulster, and Greene Counties have a common history, developing major agricultural and industrial centers because of their proximity to the Hudson River. There is no such common history with counties located in the middle and western portions of New York State.

The five County Seat Cities of Hudson, Poughkeepsie, Troy, Kingston, and Catskill had a similar rise as major industrial cities that suffered steep economic declines in the first half of the 20th century but are now experiencing a great resurgence. These small to medium sized cities have diverse racial, ethnic, religious, cultural, socio-economic, and gender/sexual orientation populations. These cities have higher poverty levels than the surrounding countryside and have similar challenges to meet the need for infrastructure, broadband, workforce housing, and healthcare throughout the counties. Columbia County should be in a congressional district with its neighbors who face the same challenges and concerns.

Our proximity to New York City has created a rich, year-round arts community, with many artists, painters, dancers, musicians, actors, galleries, and antique stores that all create a destination for tourism. There is a significant and growing population of New York City dual homeowners. Newer residents are starting local small businesses, adding to the economic diversity in our county. Columbia County is also home to many exurban communities of Albany, not Ithaca or Binghamton. Columbia County is tethered economically, culturally and socially to its neighbors to the north and south. The proposed map ignores these connections, and in doing so, denied our county of effective representation.

Please preserve Columbia County as a unified community of interest with our neighboring counties. We share similar agricultural, historic, artistic, and economic challenges and opportunities with Dutchess, Ulster, Rensselaer, and Greene

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

Counties as part of the Mid-Hudson Valley region. Dividing Columbia County, or separating us from the Mid-Hudson Valley region, would seriously impact the residents who want to build for the future and be fairly represented in

Congress. It would be a gross miscarriage of justice that will have long-term adverse consequences for our residents and our region if these district lines are allowed to stand. We urge you to correct this grave mistake.

Very truly yours, J. Michael O'Hara and Ruth Tamaroff PO Box 1180 Hudson, NY 12534

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 611

INDEX NO. E2022-0116CV

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 05/18/2022

# Brenda A. Wise

From:

Courtney Ray <Courtney.Ray@brooklyn.cuny.edu>

Sent:

Wednesday, May 18, 2022 11:17 AM

To:

Brenda A. Wise

Subject:

Redistricting map

The current proposed district map for NY disenfranchises several minority communities within NYC. Several neighborhoods are getting split in weird and frankly unethical ways. In order to maintain representation in a fair way, the currently proposed map needs to be thrown out and redrawn.

Dr. C. Ray

Sent from my iPhone