

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA  
RICHMOND DIVISION**

GOLDEN BETHUNE-HILL, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

VIRGINIA STATE BOARD OF ELECTIONS,  
*et al.*,

Defendants,

v.

VIRGINIA HOUSE OF DELEGATES, *et al.*,

Intervenor-Defendants.

Civil Action No. 3:14-cv-00852-REP-  
GBL-BMK

**JOINT RESPONSE TO ORDER OF APRIL 5, 2017**

Plaintiffs, Defendants, and Defendant-Intervenors (collectively, the “Parties”) respectfully submit this Joint Response to the Court’s Order of April 5, 2017. The Court has requested the “Petition Appendix” in this case in order to “aid the Court in understanding the oral argument that transpired before the United States Supreme Court.” Order, Dkt. No. 135. The Parties understand the Court to be requesting a copy of the Joint Appendix filed alongside the merits briefs.<sup>1</sup> That Joint Appendix, referenced in the Parties’ merits briefs and during oral argument before the Supreme Court, is 2,321 pages long and comprises six bound volumes. Given the large size of the Joint Appendix, the filing must be broken up into multiple docket entries for e-filing purposes. Plaintiffs will promptly e-file the Joint Appendix.

---

<sup>1</sup> Because this case was appealed on direct review, rather than certiorari review, to the Supreme Court, the Parties did not file a Petition Appendix.

Additionally, the Parties will be delivering courtesy hard copy volumes of the Joint Appendix to each chambers and will split among themselves the printing costs.

DATED: April 6, 2017

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ John K. Roche

John K. Roche, VSB No. 68594  
Kevin J. Hamilton (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
**PERKINS COIE LLP**  
700 Thirteenth Street, N.W., Suite 600  
Washington, D.C. 20005-3960  
Telephone: 202.434.1627  
Facsimile: 202.654.9106

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

/s/ Stuart Raphael

Stuart Raphael, VSB No. 30380  
**OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY  
GENERAL**  
202 North 9th Street  
Richmond, VA 23219  
Telephone: 804.786.7240  
Facsimile: 804.371.0200

*Attorneys for Defendants*

/s/ Effrem Mark Braden

Effrem Mark Braden (admitted *pro hac*  
*vice*)

**BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP (DC-NA)**

Washington Square

Suite 1100

1050 Connecticut Ave NW

Washington, DC 20036

Telephone: 202. 861.1504

Facsimile: 202.861.1783

*Attorneys for Defendant-Intervenors*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

On April 6, 2017, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will then send a notification of such filing (NEF) to the following:

Katherine Lea McKnight  
Baker & Hostetler LLP (DC)  
1050 Connecticut Ave NW  
Suite 1100  
Washington, DC 20036  
202-861-1702  
Fax: 202-861-1783  
jwalrath@bakerlaw.com  
kmcknight@bakerlaw.com

Effrem Mark Braden  
Baker & Hostetler LLP (DC-NA)  
Washington Square  
Suite 1100  
Washington, DC 20036  
202-861-1504  
Fax: 202-861-1783  
mbraden@bakerlaw.com

Of counsel:

Dale Oldham, Esq.  
1119 Susan St.  
Columbia, SC 29210  
803-772-7729  
dloesq@aol.com

*Attorneys for Defendant-Intervenors*

Jeffrey P. Brundage  
Daniel Ari Glass  
Kathleen Angell Gallagher  
Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott LLC  
1717 Pennsylvania Ave NW, Suite 1200  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
202-659-6600  
Fax: 202-659-6699  
jbrundage@eckertseamans.com  
dglass@eckertseamans.com  
kgallagher@eckertseamans.com

Godfrey T. Pinn, Jr.  
Harrell & Chambliss LLP  
Eighth and Main Building  
707 East Main Street  
Suite 1000  
Richmond, VA 23219  
gpinn@hclawfirm.com

Anthony F. Troy  
Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott LLC  
707 East Main Street  
Suite 1450  
Richmond, Virginia 23219  
804-788-7751  
Fax: 804-698-2950  
ttroy@eckertseamans.com

*Attorneys for Defendants*

By /s/ John K. Roche  
John K. Roche (VSB #68594)  
Perkins Coie LLP  
700 13th St. N.W., Suite 600  
Washington, D.C. 20005-3960  
Phone: (202) 654-1627  
Fax: (202) 654-9106  
[J@perkinscoie.com](mailto:J@perkinscoie.com)  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*